Digital Metrics for Classical
Beginning the Discussion
Background

- Begin with “Opportunities in Journalism,” co-sponsored by SRG and Wyncote, March 15
- Form a working group: First meet Apr 28
- Continue through several webinars and in-person meetings
Aims of the Working Group

1. Refine and advance KPIs for News-centered public radio stations and some joint licensees.
2. Identify appropriate communications and conferencing technology for this group process.
3. Understand visitor/user interests, values and behavior through personnas and advance data analytics.
4. Develop a framework for increasing online subscription revenues.
5. Expand tool development and data sharing.
Motivating Interests

• There was a high level of agreement that, “as a system, we haven’t defined success.”

• Top line data is inadequate for
  – Managing daily digital operations,
  – Measuring a broadly defined sense of “impact,”
  – Identifying the parts of local digital journalism that support our business model.

• There was noticeable support for NPR Digital.
It’s a “News Group”

- NPR
- APM/MPR
- WGBH
- WNYC
- KQED
- WBUR
- WBEZ
- KPCC
- OPB
- KUT
- KPBS
- St. Louis Public Radio
- NHPR
- WITF
- WHYY
- WAMU
- PRX
- CPB
- Greater Public
...with National Networks and Podcast Producers...

- NPR
- APM/MPR
- WGBH
- WNYC
- KQED
- WBUR
- WBEZ
- KPCC
- OPB
- KUT
- KPBS
- St. Louis Public Radio
- NHPR
- WITF
- WHYY
- WAMU
- PRX
- CPB
- Greater Public
General Observations

• The digital staff and senior staff at larger stations are bringing a deeper skill set to digital analytics.

• NPR Digital staff is providing strong and continued support.

• Stations are asking: Is our investment in digital service providing adequate returns, both in service and revenue?
Process so far

• Collect Dashboards from all 16 participants
  – 110 different items now being tracked.
• Survey the Participants
  – We identified common objectives
• Met in Boston 4/28 (with two follow ups)
  – Examined Dashboards
  – Discussed “Frameworks”
Boston Meeting Highlights

• Steve Mulder introduces the NPR Framework
  GROW – KNOW – ENGAGE – MONETIZE
• WBEZ dashboard: separate “Listening sessions” from “Non-Listening sessions.”
• KQED provides a “rainbow engagement framework.”
• WGBH shares initial persona development
• MPR, OPB, NHPR and others provide additional perspective
After the first meeting, all of the discussion has focused on GROWTH METRICS.
From WBEZ dashboard discussion

If people aren’t streaming, what are they doing? – WBEZ.org

**NON-STREAMERS**

- **Read**
  - 0.5 stories per visit – here to read, not listen

- **Likely Donors**
  - 5% of sessions included donation – potentially broadcast audience coming in to donate

- **Majority Mobile**
  - 60% of sessions on mobile device – largely from social referrals

- **New Visitors**
  - 58% New

**STREAMERS**

- **Listen**
  - 0.1 stories per visit – Mostly listening, not reading

- **Already Donated**
  - <1% of sessions included donation; loyal streamers who do donate do so in one of many sessions

- **Majority Desktop**
  - Loyal listeners – any mobile listening done on mobile app instead of mobile web

- **Loyalists**
  - 86% Returning

**Not Much Overlap**

These are nearly disparate groups – only 8% of total users fell into both categories

Source: Google Analytics (Sep 2016-Feb 2017)

Provided by Steve Rish and Isaac Kim
### Levels of Engagement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sustainers</th>
<th>Contributors</th>
<th>Engaged</th>
<th>Connectors</th>
<th>Frequents</th>
<th>Audience</th>
<th>Inclined</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sustaining</td>
<td>Active donors</td>
<td>Email subscribers</td>
<td>Social followers</td>
<td>KQED.org users</td>
<td>KQED.org users</td>
<td>Engaged Learner Explorer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signal Society</td>
<td>Digital fundraising</td>
<td>Event attendees</td>
<td></td>
<td>KQED.org pageviews</td>
<td>TV viewers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producers Circle</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>TV AQH</td>
<td>Radio listeners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legacy Society</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Radio AQH</td>
<td>Live audio stream listeners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>KQED app</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Video &amp; audio plays</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Education plays</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From WGBH persona discussion

---

**Janine**  
The Cultural Connoisseur

**News/Info Habits:**  
- Gets news online and from radio (NPR, NYT, WSJ)  
- Reads content-rich email subscriptions like The Skimm  
- Follows arts organizations through web, email, social

**WGBH Habits:**  
- Attends WGBH events with family – Fun Fest, 5K run  
- Visits WGBHNews.org and live streams BPR  
- Watches BBC drama, Masterpiece, & Frontline

**Media:**  
- Cable package with internet  
- Heavy user of iPhone and iPad

**Donation Profile:**  
- $120/year sustainer  
- Responded to a WGBH email after signing up for the WGBH-localized version of the PBS Channel on Roku

---

**Janine wants to...**  
* Be a lifelong learner  
* Stay in the know about issues  
* Share photos of her kids, stay connected with family

---

*The arts are important to the fabric of my community. That’s why I support PBS and WGBH.*

---

**Age 42 | Marketing Manager | Brookline | Married**
And after Apr 28.... we

• Started with the NPR “Grow/Know/Engage/Monetize” Framework
  – Steve Mulder segments the 110 metrics.

• Hosted two follow-up meetings
  – Discussions of “Metrics related to Growth”

• Agreed to focus on “news stations with a large investment in posting news stories.”

Steve’s work is available for review at http://bit.ly/2ujHki6
## Digging Deeper in “GROW”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Org goal</th>
<th>Platform</th>
<th>Metric</th>
<th>Priority</th>
<th>KPI?</th>
<th>Question we're trying to answer</th>
<th>Pros</th>
<th>Cons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>Website</td>
<td>Users</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td>How many people are we reaching overall?</td>
<td>Familiar, already measured overall reach is still important</td>
<td>Overcounting due to multiple device usage (applies to all user metrics)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>Website</td>
<td>In-market users</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>How many people are we reaching in our area who we can reasonably target for long-term relationships?</td>
<td>Keeps us focused on addressable local market</td>
<td>Not sure how actionable it is. Not as relevant for national content producers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>Website</td>
<td>Users with 3+ sessions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>How many people are we reaching who are loyal visitors and more likely to become long-term relationships and donors?</td>
<td>Keeps us focused on growing loyal audience, not fly-bys who are less likely to ever donate. More actionable: increase sessions/user.</td>
<td>Small segment and not naturally growing. Potentially difficult to increase.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>Website</td>
<td>Users who listen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>How many people are we reaching who are consuming our core audio content and perhaps more likely to become loyal audience and donors?</td>
<td>Keeps us focused on our core: audio. We assume listeners are more likely to become donors. More actionable: increase listening.</td>
<td>Small segment. Websites are different than broadcast and listening may not always signal loyalty potential.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>Website</td>
<td>Demographics (e.g., users under 45)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Are we reaching a diverse audience?</td>
<td>Keeps us focused on diversity.</td>
<td>GA can track age and gender but not ethnicity, so we miss an important one without surveys.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>Website</td>
<td>Pageviews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>How much content is being consumed overall, with a focus on the written word?</td>
<td>More accurate number than users, can be added across properties.</td>
<td>Measures overall usage, not reach. Can grow even if audience isn't growing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>Website</td>
<td>Story pageviews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>How much written-word journalism is being consumed overall?</td>
<td>Focuses on the pageviews that matter most. More accurate number than users, can be added across properties.</td>
<td>Might overweight text content. Measures overall usage, not reach. Can grow even if audience isn't growing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>Website</td>
<td>Sessions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>How many visits overall is our site getting?</td>
<td>More accurate number than users, can be added across properties.</td>
<td>Measures overall usage, not reach. Can grow even if audience isn't growing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Which of these 7 “growth” metrics is provides the best guidance?
Draft conclusions
(not yet formally accepted by the group)

• “Total Uniques/Users:” essential but flawed.

PROs
• Universally shared as a way of measuring reach.
• Required for ad placement sales.
• “The top of the funnel”

CONs
• Volatile.
• Affected by reposting and viral distribution.
• Contains many one-time visitors
• Only loosely related to business imperatives
Draft conclusions (not yet formally accepted by the group)

• “Users visiting X times per period*” is likely to be a one of the growth KPIs.

PROs
• Return visits is a key indicator of loyalty.
• Other research suggests “frequency of use” is related to “willingness to support.”

CONs
• There is no way to capture cross-platform use.
• May need to distinguish listening from non-listening sessions.

*For now, at the recommendation of APM, we are using x=3 or “3 visits per month.”
WHAT DOES ONLINE TRAFFIC REALLY LOOK LIKE?
At news stations, traffic patterns are affected by weekday vs. weekend and stories that “pop.”

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017
Among the three news stations I examined, the tiers of: all users – return users – users returning 3xs in a month were relatively similar.

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017
At news stations, traffic patterns are affected by weekday vs. weekend and stories that “pop.”

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017
Music Stations are Different

The 3 classical music stations I reviewed:

• Had noticeably fewer users (uniques) and fewer sessions (as a ratio of their broadcast cume).

• Had different ratios of New and Return Users that the three news stations.

• Had noticeably higher % of returning users and “users returning X times per period.”
At the three Classical stations, traffic patterns were shaped by weekdays vs. weekends. None of the three I examined had stories that “pop.”

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017
Classical Music 2
Daily User Count

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017
Classical Music 3
Daily User Count

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017
C-M Stations vs. News: Fewer Users

For Jan 1 – Aug 1, 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>News Station 1</th>
<th>Classical Music Station 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Users</strong></td>
<td>1,565,388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Return users</strong></td>
<td>633,790</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>New Users</strong></td>
<td>931,598</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

100% 100%
40% 67%
60% 33%
C-M stations: higher *Return-Users %* at each tier of Return visits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th># of Users at X Visits</th>
<th>Classical Music Station 1</th>
<th>News Station 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>All Users</td>
<td>All Users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>61,909</td>
<td>944,843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 visits</td>
<td>13,592</td>
<td>133,291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 v</td>
<td>7,060</td>
<td>55,958</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 v</td>
<td>4,783</td>
<td>33,940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 v</td>
<td>3,708</td>
<td>23,882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 v</td>
<td>3,055</td>
<td>18,427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Caution very small sample: 3 News and 3 Classical Stations

For Jan 1 – Aug 1, 2017
News Stations had more mobile traffic (as % of total user base)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% of total users on this platform</th>
<th>News1</th>
<th>News2</th>
<th>News3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Desktop</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobile</td>
<td><strong>57%</strong></td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tablet</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Caution very small sample:
3 News and 3 Classical Stations

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017
C-Music attracted a high % Desktop across many sectors of total user base

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% of Total Users on Desktop</th>
<th>C-M1</th>
<th>C-M2</th>
<th>C-M3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All Users</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Return users</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3Vs</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Caution very small sample: 3 News and 3 Classical Stations

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017
Even for News Stations: 3vs are more likely to use Desktops

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% of Users with 3+Visits</th>
<th>News1</th>
<th>News2</th>
<th>News3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Desktop</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobile</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tablet</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Caution very small sample: 3 News and 3 Classical Stations

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017
C-M Stations: Higher % Return Users, 3Vs than News Stations
(as a proportion of their total online traffic)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>C-M1</th>
<th>C-M2</th>
<th>C-M3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Users</strong></td>
<td>165,207</td>
<td>143,050</td>
<td>152,272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C-M % Returning Users</strong></td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C-M % 3Vs</strong></td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>% 3Vs (News)</strong></td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sessions per Mo</strong></td>
<td>4.54</td>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>4.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C-M Returning Users</strong></td>
<td>9.19</td>
<td>9.05</td>
<td>9.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C-M 3Vs Sessions/Mo</strong></td>
<td>7.31</td>
<td>7.20</td>
<td>6.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3Vs (News)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Caution very small sample:
3 News and 3 Classical Stations

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017
3V Users More Locally Concentrated for News Stations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% of Users in State*/Metro</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In State*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-M1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-M2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-M3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This may reflect the international, especially Asian, streaming audience for the West Coast C-music stations we chose.

Caution very small sample: 3 News and 3 Classical Stations

For May 28 – Jun 24, 2017

*State or adjacent states
For more two decades, Individual Giving has driven Radio System Financial Growth
Next up for me

• Continued support for the Digital Analytics working group.
• “Local That Works” at the PRPD Conference
• “Local That Works Summit” at the Super Regional Conference in September.
Contact me

mark@publicmediafutures.org
markfuerst@gmail.com